

Comparison Of Teacher Recruitment And Development In Indonesia And England

Zahratul Azizah¹⁾, Sri Mariya²⁾ Nurhizrah Gistituati³⁾, Rusdinal⁴⁾, Azwar Ananda⁵⁾
^{1,2,3,4,5)} University Negeri Padang

*Corresponding Author
Email : zahratulazizah10@gmail.com

Abstract

The teacher is a profession that has an important role in realizing quality education, especially in the learning process in formal schools. For this reason, there needs to be a selection carried out in selecting prospective teachers and also a coaching process so that the teaching profession contributes to success in the world of education. This study provides an overview of the differences of teacher recruitment and development in Indonesia and England. The method used in this study is a literature study obtained from various writings in journals and books. The results obtained in this study indicate several comparison: 1) there are two types of teacher recruitment in Indonesia, namely selection of civil servant teachers in public schools conducted by the government under the auspices of the Ministry of Education and Culture, and selection carried out by foundations to become honorary teachers or part-time teachers at private schools with the provisions and rules made by the school itself. While in England, the selection is carried out by each school that will accept prospective teachers with the terms and conditions that have been determined and apply to public schools and private schools; 2) Development of teachers in Indonesia is carried out after qualifying to become teachers (both civil servants and non-civil servants) which is provided by the government or private sector, while in England, coaching is carried out before and after becoming a teacher which is the responsibility of each school.

Keywords: Teacher; Recruitment; Training

INTRODUCTION

The results of the program for international student assessment (PISA) in 2018 which were announced simultaneously on December 3, 2019 to all participating countries of the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD), show that Indonesia is still in the lowest position, which is ranked 74th out of 79 countries with scores for reading, math, and science were 371, 379, and 396. This result contrasts with the United Kingdom (England), which is ranked 14th out of 79 countries, with scores for reading, math and science 504, 502, 505. The results of this PISA not only discuss country rankings, but can also provide an overview of how effective schools are in preparing their students for education. Effective schools are certainly supported by teachers who have an important role in the implementation of learning in schools.

Teachers play a major role in the development of education, especially those held formally in schools (Rony, 2019). The success of a school depends on the professionalism of teachers in teaching their students through a quality teaching and learning process. The teacher is seen as a key factor, because he interacts directly with students during the teaching and learning process in the classroom. Therefore, of course there is a recruitment mechanism that must be carried out in obtaining a professional teacher in the field of education. The recruitment process is carried out in order to select teachers who have competence, are experts in educating, and teach according to their fields, and have the attitude of an honest teacher,

being good role models for students and the community so that they have a positive impact on achieving educational goals.

Beside that, in order to carry out the learning process well, teachers need to improve their professional competence through a series of teacher training. Teachers need to be given continuous coaching. Coaching for teachers with the hope: 1) teachers as educators whose main task is to teach, have personality characteristics that greatly influence the success of human resource development; 2) a solid personality from the figure of a teacher will set a good example for students and the community, so that the teacher will appear as a person who deserves to be "*digugu*" (obeyed by his advice, speech, or orders) and "*imitated*" (in the example of his attitude and behavior); 3) the development of teacher personality competence by the principal and the presence of internal and external factors can greatly influence the formation of the teacher's personality.

This paper will describe how the comparison teacher recruitment and development carried out by Indonesia and England. This comparison will provide contributions and recommendations for us the Indonesian state in improving the quality of education and also in making an education policy related to teachers.

RESEARCH METHODS

The method used in this research is literature review. The literature review is sourced from various readings such as reference books, several articles in several journals, and the results of previous similar studies that are useful for obtaining and collecting all kinds of information that supports the writing of this paper.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Teacher Recruitment

Recruitment is defined as an activity in finding a group of applicants who have qualifications in accordance with the goals of an organization. This activity is of course carried out in several stages that require quite a long time, and also requires coordinated action from many members of an organization.

Recruitment is a process of identifying the suitability of prospective workers who are competent in carrying out the duties of the institution, and must consider the needs of those who will occupy the work position (Muscalu, 2015). Recruitment is the process of searching for prospective employees who meet the requirements in the required number and types (Fahmi, 2017). It should be understood that the recruitment process is carried out through a rigorous and detailed screening process with the aim of producing candidates who are truly deemed worthy. There are many ways to get employees who are truly in accordance with their fields, including by establishing communication with universities that have a good reputation.

Teacher recruitment is one of the important factors for improving the quality of education in schools. Qualified and knowledgeable teachers are essential to provision of a good education system (Gorard et al., 2021). Recruitment will be held if the school experiences a shortage of teachers due to various reasons, such as a teacher who retires or a teacher who changes schools for certain reasons (Sandela, 2019). Teachers who retire or don't work anymore because their tenure has reached the age limit, where teachers with civil servant status will retire at least at the age of 58 years, this condition will create a vacancy in teacher formation in schools and need to find a teacher immediately. In addition, the condition of

teachers being transferred to other schools for some reason is also a factor in the need for teacher recruitment.

System of Teacher Recruitment in Indonesia

There are several stages in the process of recruiting teachers at schools, including planning, implementing, and supervising. In the planning stage, the following steps were carried out: 1) analysis of the preparation of the plan in order to obtain data and information related to the formation and number of teachers needed; 2) preparing recruitment, starting from determining the recruitment team, determining the qualifications of applicants, determining the required budget. The implementation stage is carried out by a team that has been appointed with stages starting from the distribution of recruitment announcements, acceptance of applications, selection, to the selection decision to choose who will qualify as a teacher. The supervision stage is carried out in order to oversee the recruitment process, in order to avoid unwanted things such as fraud in the selection of prospective teachers to be selected.

The flow that is followed in conducting teacher recruitment starts from the stage of proposing additional teachers by the principal to the Education and Culture Office, then if the proposal is approved, the principal makes various preparations (forming a selection team, administrative team, setting criteria that must be met), then recruitment is carried out (the application file will be checked by the administration team if the data is valid, prospective teachers can immediately take various tests, namely the academic potential test on a computer and non-written tests (teaching practices and interviews), then the selection results will be assessed by the selection team (Putri, n.d.). In Indonesia, teacher recruitment conducted in private schools is different from teacher recruitment conducted in public schools. The recruitment of teachers in public schools is carried out by the government based on the required formation, with the status of a civil servant teacher (PNS), while the recruitment of teachers in private schools is carried out by the foundation which is delegated to the principal, with the status of teachers as honorary teachers.

There are two types of recruitment carried out by the Indonesian government for the formation of state civil apparatus teacher (ASN), namely teachers with civil servant status and teachers with employment contract government employee status (PPPK). Teachers with the status of civil servants have the status of permanent employees and have a personnel identification number (NIK). Based on Law No. 5 of 2014, the teacher has the right to receive salary, allowances, facilities, leave, pension insurance, old-age insurance, protection and competency development. PNS teacher positions start from the bottom (young teachers in groups IIIa - IIIb, junior teachers IIIc - IIId, middle teachers IVa - IVb, and main teachers IVc - IVd). The age limit for appointment to become a civil servant teacher is 35 years old, and recruitment is carried out simultaneously nationally which passes through the stages of administrative selection, selection of basic competencies, and selection of field competencies. First aid teachers have a status as employees with a minimum work agreement of 1 year and can be extended for a maximum of 30 years, do not get certain facilities and old age allowances such as civil servant teachers, for positions they can immediately get the highest position, there is no age limit for admissions 2019 through the stages of administrative selection, competency selection and interview selection.

Unlike the case with recruitment for honorary teachers. Honorary teachers are teachers who are not civil servants, serving in state school institutions and private schools (Andina & Arifa, 2021). These teachers do not get the same facilities as PNS teachers, sometimes the salary they receive does not match the tasks they do. On average, these honorary teachers can become PNS or PPPK teachers in accordance with applicable regulations (through a selection process). The recruitment of honorary teachers is also supported by several situations: 1) the

existence of fiscal incentives to local governments; 2) School Operational Assistance (BOS) can be used to pay honorary teachers; 3) there is a practical political role in which many honorary teacher appointments occur after the regional head election (Andina & Arifa, 2021).

System of Teacher Recruitmen in England

Some schools in England have had to start recruiting teachers from abroad as many qualified teachers decide to work outside England. The preparation of education personnel in the England is carried out strictly in an orderly manner and develops according to the needs of the implementation of education. There are three ways to qualify to become a teacher in the England: 1) take a three-year course for a nongraduate certificate of education; 2) study for three and four years to obtain a bachelor of education degree (bachelor of education); 3) one year study at the postgraduate level for those who have a first non-educational degree. Since 1984, to enter the field of teacher work, only through the postgraduate pathway, besides that mathematics and English competence in the GCE-'O' standard is highly expected (Agustiar, 2001). While in education, teachers can specialize in a particular field or level. In Scotland, teachers can only teach at a level according to their qualifications. No formal teaching qualifications are required for teachers teaching in further education (further education) and higher education.

To be able to teach in England, there are several paths that can be done, namely starting from attending undergraduate education at a university (minimum 3 years), then following a postgraduate certificate education (PGCE) program, participating in the School Centered Initial Teacher Training (SCITT) consortium, participating in HEI: Teach First and Research in Schools (Mayer & Mills, 2021). The process of recruiting teachers at the primary and secondary education levels is under the supervision of the National College for Teaching and Leadership (NCTL). Each teacher must hold a Qualified Teacher Status (QTS) certificate issued by the NCTL. To get this certificate, prospective teachers are required to attend Initial Teaching Training (ITT). At the level of further education, teachers must have a Qualified Teaching Learning and Skills (QTLS) or Associate Teaching Learning (ATL) certificate.

Same in Indonesia, England and the US, a teacher shortage is predicted to get worse as the pupil population is rising and more teachers are leaving before retirement (Hayes, 2017). Therefore, it is necessary to immediately recruit prospective teachers to fill the vacancies in the existing formations. Teachers in England are not classified as civil servants, but are recruited by local governments or institutions depending on the type of school.

To become a teacher in England and Wales, one is required to hold a QTS certificate. This certificate was obtained after participating in the ITT program published by The National College for Teaching and Leadership (NCTL). The ITT program is organized by a school or college that has been appointed and financed by the NCTL. After attending the ITT training and obtaining the QTS, then passing the Skill Tests, qualified teachers are required to undergo a probationary or induction period for one academic year or three school requirements, as this is a requirement to teach in schools in England.

The probationary period can be done on a full or part time basis. For those who will do it on a part-time basis, the probationary period lasts for two academic years. Evaluation will be held at the end of each school term. The evaluation is carried out by the induction tutor or the principal of the school where the teacher teaches. At the end of the probationary period, the evaluation results from each school term are collected and based on that the induction tutor or school principal will make a recommendation submitted by the relevant institution. The content of the recommendation states whether the progress and evaluation of the prospective teacher meets the Teachers' Standards.

Furthermore, the relevant institution makes a decision whether the prospective teacher can be declared passed or failed or requires an extension of the probationary period. This decision was then handed back to the principal and NCTL. The NCTL party will contact the teacher regarding the results of the probationary period undertaken. The trial period can only be done once. If the evaluation results show that the teacher in question does not meet the standards used, then he will not lose the QTS, cannot be recruited by the school, and his name will be listed on the NCTL's failed probationary list. It is recommended that the trial period begins immediately after receiving the QTS. However, this is subject to agreement between the relevant institution and the principal and NQT. The relevant agency in question will ensure independent quality assurance. Usually, this institution is the local government where the school is located.

Teacher Development in Indonesia

Development is defined as an effort made in order to develop all the potential possessed. RI Law No. 14 of 2005 concerning Teachers and Lecturers, has explained that teachers must have qualifications; Minimum academic degree S1/D4, competent (having pedagogic, personality, social, and professional competencies), and certified educator. Therefore, teachers need to continuously develop themselves both self-taught, through activities organized by schools, through various trainings. Teacher coaching is a form of strategy that can be carried out by school principals in improving teacher competence in implementing the teaching and learning process both in the classroom and outside the classroom (Anisa & Maunah, 2022).

To become a teacher, it does not only require a bachelor's degree (S1) and non-educational D4 according to the field of study, but also professional training after undergraduate education to equip teachers with professional skills. The Indonesian government has made various efforts to improve the quality of human resources (teachers and other education personnel), ranging from various forms of training to efforts to increase the educational qualifications of Diploma 1, 2, 3 (D1, D2, D3) teachers to Bachelors (D1, D2, D3). S1), even undergraduate teachers are given the opportunity to S2, and even to the provision of professional allowances. Furthermore, there is also the Teacher Professional Education (PPG) program which provides training to teachers who have served. The purpose of this PPG is not only to train the skills needed in the teaching profession, it is also one of the requirements to get an educator certificate, or better known as teacher certification.

The development of competence, professionalism and self-development of teachers in schools still really needs to be improved and needs serious attention in order to build teacher professional competence in following the dynamics of education (Syairozi, 2022). In Indonesia, professional teachers cannot be born only by one institution, but require integration by various related and responsible parties. In this regard, the coaching and development of teacher professional competence needs to be carried out with integration between the Educational Personnel Education Institution (LPTK) as teacher producers, teacher user schools and the Education Office as teacher training institutions. Continuous teacher professional development can also be carried out through participation in in-service training, reading and writing papers or articles in various journals, participating in scientific activities, conducting classroom action research, participating in professional organizations/communities, and collaborating with other educators.

Teacher Development in England

The development of teachers in England is the responsibility of each school. The guidance carried out consists of providing training and evaluating teacher performance. The

training carried out by schools is tailored to the needs of teachers and schools, not focused on subject training. The training provided to teachers can be carried out in various institutions such as school agencies, local government agencies, teacher-teacher associations, private training providers.

In school institutions, the training provided is the responsibility of the school, where the training provided to teachers is in the form of peer-teaching training organized by schools that already have an 'outstanding' predicate. Furthermore, teachers also receive training from the local government in the form of Continuous Professional Development (CPD) training for free or at an affordable cost. The training can be carried out at the local government office as well as directly at the respective schools (in-service training).

Teacher associations in England also provide a lot of CPD training to teachers in the England, where this training is individual (not per school), and usually this training is provided free of charge or some are paid but at an affordable cost. In addition, teachers in England can also receive professional training provided by private institutions. To find out which training is available in England, teachers can use information from the Teacher Development Trust Advisor, which is an independent organization that provides information services about training service providers.

Teacher performance evaluation is also a part of coaching teachers in England. The evaluation is carried out in order to assess the performance of the teachers in the school. There are two evaluations conducted on teachers: 1) induction, evaluation of new teachers; 2) School Teachers' Appraisal, evaluation of permanent teachers (Consultation & To, n.d.). Induction is carried out for one year for teachers who have just passed the selection, and are expected to graduate with satisfactory results and if they do not pass, the teacher is not allowed to teach at the school concerned. In the School Teachers' Appraisal, it is carried out on permanent teachers or principals. The difference between the two evaluations above can be seen from the pre-evaluation and post-evaluation processes. The pre-evaluation process is different because new teachers go through a recruitment process, while teacher pre-evaluations still require setting tasks and targets to be achieved. Meanwhile for the post-evaluation process, if teachers do not meet the standards, they will not be immediately fired like new teachers. However, they will be directed to the Capability Procedure.

In line with today's developments, a teacher is required to be more professional in carrying out his duties as an educator. Teachers in England are not only required to be professional in teaching, but are also required to have 'evidence-based practice' skills that can improve the quality of student learning outcomes (Barrett & Hordern, 2021). This expertise is obtained by the teacher through the research he does, service activities that can develop his knowledge so that in the end it will contribute to improving student learning outcomes.

CONCLUSION

Based on the results of this discussion, it can be concluded that in Indonesia, teachers are recruited by the government and foundations. Teachers recruited by the government are placed in state schools as employees of the state civil apparatus (ASN), namely teachers with the status of civil servants (PNS) and teachers with the status of government employees with work agreements (PPPK). Teachers who are recruited by the foundation, are placed in private schools to become honorary teachers. In England, the teaching profession is not a government employee. The teacher recruitment process at the primary and secondary education levels is under the supervision of the National College for Teaching and Leadership (NCTL). Each teacher must have a Qualified Teacher Status (QTS) certificate issued by the NCTL. To get this certificate, prospective teachers are required to attend Initial Teaching Training (ITT). At the

further level of education, teachers must have a Qualified Teaching Learning and Skills (QTLS) or Associate Teaching Learning (ATL) certificate. In relation to teacher development, in Indonesia the responsibility for this is the principal, the government through the education office, and the Educational Personnel Education Institute (LPTK) for people who have officially become teachers. The guidance is carried out starting from increasing educational qualifications, participating in various trainings that have been provided in order to improve the quality of teacher professionalism. Whereas in England, teacher development is the responsibility of each school. The guidance carried out consists of providing training and evaluating teacher performance. The training carried out by schools is tailored to the needs of teachers and schools, not focused on subject training. The training provided to teachers can be carried out in various institutions such as school agencies, local government agencies, teacher-teacher associations, private training providers.

REFERENCES

- Agustiar, N. S. (2001). *Perbandingan Sistem Pendidikan 15 Negara. Lubuk Agung Bandung.*
- Andina, E., & Arifa, F. N. (2021). Problematika Seleksi dan Rekrutmen Guru Pemerintah di Indonesia. *Aspirasi: Jurnal Masalah-Masalah Sosial*, 12(1), 85–105.
- Anisa, D. L. N., & Maunah, B. (2022). Pembinaan terhadap Semangat Guru. *Jurnal Administrasi Pendidikan Islam*, 4(1), 62–77.
- Barrett, B., & Hordern, J. (2021). Rethinking the foundations: Towards powerful professional knowledge in teacher education in the USA and England. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 53(2), 153–165.
- Consultation, A., & To, E. (n.d.). *Proposed changes to performance management and capability arrangements for teachers.*
- Fahmi, I. (2017). *Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia: Teori dan Aplikasi.*
- Gorard, S., Maria Ventista, O., Morris, R., & See, B. H. (2021). Who wants to be a teacher? Findings from a survey of undergraduates in England. *Educational Studies*, 1–23.
- Hayes, P. (2017). Five Reasons for UK's Worst Ever Teacher Shortage. *Huffpost, February*, 26.
- Mayer, D., & Mills, M. (2021). Professionalism and teacher education in Australia and England. *European Journal of Teacher Education*, 44(1), 45–61.
- Muscalu, E. (2015). Sources of human resources recruitment organization. *Land Forces Academy Review*, 20(3), 351.
- Putri, S. A. A. K. (n.d.). *Sistem Rekrutmen Guru Dalam Upaya Meningkatkan Mutu Pendidikan.*
- Rony, R. (2019). Sistem Rekrutmen Tenaga Pendidik (Guru). *MIYAH: Jurnal Studi Islam*, 14(2), 37–57.

Sandela, M. (2019). Manajemen Rekrutmen Tenaga Pendidik Di Sdit Sa'adiah Kecamatan Kubung Kabupaten Solok. *Al-Fikrah: Jurnal Manajemen Pendidikan*, 7(2), 155–166.

Syairozi, I. (2022). Pembinaan Profesi Guru Pendidikan Agama Islam dalam Mengadaptasi Siswa Generasi Abad 21. *SAP (Susunan Artikel Pendidikan)*, 6(3).